A HEALTH POLICY AND SYSTEMS RESEARCH READER ON HUMAN RESOURCES FOR HEALTH
Chapter 6. Leadership, management and organizational cultures

Aku Kwamie, Aarushi Bhatnagar, Uta Lehmann
Outline

1. Definitions
2. Background
3. Research approaches
4. Illustrative primary research articles
5. Research challenges, gaps and future directions
1. Definitions

- Leadership and management is central to organizational functioning and there is substantial overlap between definitions

- **Leadership**: developing, nurturing and achieving organizational vision

- **Management**: operationalizing organizational function

- **Organizational culture**: pattern of values, beliefs, traditions and assumptions that organizational members share
Background

- Decision-space of managers in decentralized systems
  - Bossert (1998)

- Mechanisms and impacts of decentralization on HRM

- HRM lessons from private sector
  - Buchan (2004)
Background

- Innovative management in CAS
  Plsek & Wilson (2001)

- Distributed leadership
  Gilson & Daire (2011)

- Participatory leadership
  AHPSR (2016)
“What conditions are necessary for good leadership and management?”

Diverse research approaches

- **Use of theory**
  - Used to understand what happens at organisational interfaces, such as within health district and hospitals
  - Key theories include Lipsky’s ‘street-level bureaucracy’ (1980) and theories on organisational trust (Gilson, 2006)

- **Qualitative research methods**
  - Ethnography has been used to explore relational interactions underpinning leadership and management dynamics within organisations
  - See for example Aitken (1994) and George (2009)

- **Quantitative research methods**
  - Efforts to measure leadership, management and organizational cultures and link them to performance measures have been undertaken often using composite indices (e.g., Jayasuriya et al., 2014)

- **Action learning**
  - Cycles of implementation and learning have been useful to organizational studies
  - An exemplar is the **District Innovation and Action Learning for Health Systems Development** project (DIALHS)
Multidisciplinarity a key aspect of HPSR

- **Descriptive**: To describe to enable comparability with other contexts and experiences
- **Exploratory**: Initial research to understand and build hypotheses, concepts, theories
- **Explanatory**: In-depth research using and testing theory to explain causal mechanisms
- **Emancipatory**: To jointly understand a problem, act on it, and learn from working collaboratively and address power
- **Influence**: To assess the impact of one variable on another (adequacy, plausibility and probability analysis)
- **Predictive**: To inform about the consequences of preferences and decisions
- **What works to effect change?**
- **How to empower with change?**
- **What, when where?**
- **How and why?**

**Multidisciplinary HPSR research inferences**

**HPSR Reader on HRH**
3. Illustrative primary research articles

• Understanding and measuring management, leadership and organizational cultures
  • Social embeddedness of hospital cultures (Rocha et al, 2014)
  • Day-to-day governance in decentralization reform processes (Nyikuri et al, 2015)
  • Historical influences of broader democratic governance on local management (Kwamie et al, 2015)

• Effects of management and organizational cultures on health workers
  • Health worker perceptions of organizational fairness (Aberese-Ako et al, 2014)
  • Employee empowerment, transformational leadership and job satisfaction (Choi et al, 2016)

• Initiatives to improve leadership and organizational cultures
  • Long-term approaches to district manager capacity strengthening (Prashanth et al, 2014; Lehmann & Gilson, 2015)
1. Understanding and measuring management, leadership and organizational cultures


<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Cadre</th>
<th>Public sector hospital based nurses and auxilliary staff</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Geographical area</td>
<td>Brazil</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Research method</td>
<td>Quantitative: survey</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Research inference</td>
<td>Descriptive</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
1. Understanding and measuring management, leadership and organizational cultures


<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Cadre</th>
<th>Public sector primary health care managers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Geographical area</td>
<td>Kenya</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Research method</td>
<td>Qualitative: learning site collaborative research based on in-depth interviews and observation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Research inference</td>
<td>Explanatory/ Emancipatory</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
1. Understanding and measuring management, leadership and organizational cultures


<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Cadre</th>
<th>Public sector district managers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Geographical area</td>
<td>Ghana</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Research method</td>
<td>Qualitative: historical analysis based on literature review and key informant interviews</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Research inference</td>
<td>Explanatory</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
What makes them exemplary?

SELECTED ARTICLES

The organizational culture of a Brazilian public hospital

Helps to understand health systems as social and historical constructions; and that knowledge and standards that build organizational cultures are transmitted through prevailing values and beliefs.

Crisis and Resilience at the Frontline—Public Health Facility Managers under Devolution in a Sub-County on the Kenyan Coast

Highlights managerial resilience and adaptability needed to cope with resource scarcity and change; governance as daily, ongoing negotiation of power between actors.

The path dependence of district manager decision-space in Ghana

Notes complexities of translating decentralization power transfer into practice; use of historical analyses remains under-utilised in HPSR.
2. Effects of management, leadership and organizational cultures on health workers


<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Cadres</th>
<th>Multiple public sector hospital based health workers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Geographical area</td>
<td>Ghana</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Research methods</td>
<td>Qualitative: ethnography; participant observation, conversation and in depth interviews over 16 months in two public hospitals</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Research inference</td>
<td>Exploratory</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

HPSR Reader on HRH
2. Effects of management, leadership and organizational cultures on health workers


<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Cadres</th>
<th>Public and private sector nurses and medical assistants</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Geographical area</td>
<td>Malaysia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Research methods</td>
<td>Quantitative: Provider survey using Likert scale</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Research inference</td>
<td>Exploratory</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
What makes them exemplary?

SELECTED ARTICLES

‘Your health our concern, our health whose concern?’: perceptions of injustice in organizational relationships and processes and frontline health worker motivation in Ghana
Matilda Aberese-Ako,1,2 Han van Dijken,3 Traudie Gerrits,1 Daniel Kojo Akrinful1 and Irene Akua Ageypong3

Emphasises organizational credibility as means of supporting frontline staff in their performance.

Transformational leadership, empowerment, and job satisfaction: the mediating role of employee empowerment
Sang Long Choi1, Chin Fei Goh2, Muhammad Badrul Hisyam Adam3 and Owee Kowing Tan2

Explores employee empowerment as a mediating factor between leadership style and frontline staff satisfaction using quantitative measures.
3. Initiatives to improve leadership and organizational cultures


<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Health workers</th>
<th>Public sector primary health care facility managers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Geographical area</td>
<td>India</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Research methods</td>
<td>Mixed: realist evaluation using qualitative data (interviews and observation notes) and quantitative measures of commitment, self-efficacy and supervision style</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Research inference</td>
<td>Explanatory</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
3. Initiatives to improve leadership and organizational cultures


<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Cadre</th>
<th>Public sector district managers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Geographical area</td>
<td>South Africa</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Research methods</td>
<td>Qualitative: action learning on routine district health operations through document review, in-depth interviews, observation, review notes from field researcher, presentation and workshop notes, and meetings</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Research inference</td>
<td>Emancipatory</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
What makes them exemplary?

SELECTED ARTICLES

Presents how new approaches to capacity strengthening can support sustainable organizational change.

Provides key methodological insights into HPSR in HRH, and value of co-production in understanding leadership development.
Research challenges, gaps and future directions

• Methodology gaps
  ▪ Few LMIC studies use quantitative methods – potentially limits understandings of leadership, management and organizational cultures (see for example Cummings et al, 2015; Scott et al, 2003)

• Research topic gaps
  ▪ Few LMIC studies on gender and leadership (see for example Tlaiss, 2013; Kuhlmann et al, 2017)
Thank you

Acknowledgements

• Asha George, Veloshnee Govender and Kerry Scott for their input

Contact
agkwamie@gmail.com
aarushibhatnagar@gmail.com
ulehmann@uwc.ac.za

http://www.who.int/alliance-hpsr/resources/publications/9789241513357/en/