Bibliography on
Transplantation & Ethics

World Health Organization,
Ethics, Trade, Human Rights, and Health Law
WHO/SDE/ETH

Version 2.0

Geneva, Switzerland
27 August 2004
INTRODUCTION

This bibliography was prepared by Philipp Kellmeyer, a Junior Ethics Fellow from Heidelberg University in our department during August and September 2003, under the direction of Nikola Biller-Andorno, MD, PhD. The bibliography was compiled in preparation for the WHO consultation on "Ethics, access and safety in tissue and organ transplantation: Issues of global concern," held in Madrid from 6-9 October 2003. While this bibliography is not an official WHO document, it has proven very useful in preparing for the consultation and in the department's ongoing work with the Department of Essential Healthcare Technologies (HTP/EHT) in response to resolutions by the WHO Executive Board (in May 2003 and January 2004) and the World Health Assembly (in May 2004). We trust that others will find it useful as well, and we thank Mr. Kellmeyer for compiling it.

A.M. Capron
Director
Department of Ethics, Trade, Human Rights and Health Law

AUTHOR'S PREFACE

In the course of putting together this bibliography it has become obvious that both topics, transplantation and ethics, are inseparably entwined in highly complex and controversial discussions and discourses.

The intention of this collection is therefore to enhance and encourage the trans- and interdisciplinary dialogue on transplantation and ethics by, on the one hand, making available a selection of important scientific and medical references concerning organ and tissue transplantation and, on the other hand, providing references on ethical, social and cultural issues. This should allow the brining together of the diverse strands of discussion from all relevant disciplines on current issues in transplantation, namely organ procurement and allocation, paid organ donation, organ trafficking, tissue banking, haematopoietic stem cells and xenotransplantation.

While every effort has been made to provide a comprehensive overview of this field, experts will certainly be aware of material from their own fields that has been omitted, as no such collection can ever include all sources.

Nonetheless, we hope this bibliography will help the reader to find his or her way through the labyrinth of literature on transplantation and ethics.

Philipp Kellmeyer

Information Note on Citation System

a. Articles in scientific journals
Author(s) [up to three, all are listed; more than three, "first author et al."](publication year), "Title of the Article," Journal title volume(issue):page(s). Review. Language other than English.

b. Books
Author(s) (publication year), Book title. (City: Publisher).

c. Documents and reports from organisations or institutions
Organization/Institution etc. (publication year), Title of document. (City: Publisher).
# INDEX

1. **ORGAN TRANSPLANTATION** ................................................................. 7

1.1 **Medical aspects of organ transplantation** ........................................... 7

1.1.1 General and cross-cutting issues .................................................... 7

1.1.2 Organ donation from deceased donors vs. living organ donation ................. 7

1.1.3 Kidney: Dialysis and transplantation................................................ 8

1.1.4 Liver transplantation........................................................................ 9

1.1.5 Heart and lung transplantation....................................................... 10

1.2 **Procurement and allocation of organs from living and deceased donors** ...... 11

1.2.1 General and cross-cutting issues .................................................... 11

1.2.2 Procurement and allocation of organs: deceased donors.......................... 11

1.2.3 Procurement and allocation of organs: living donors............................... 12

1.3 **Social, cultural, psychological, gender, economic, legal and policy aspects of organ transplantation** ..................................................... 12

1.3.1 General and cross-cutting issues .................................................... 12

1.3.2 Social aspects of organ transplantation: the family and the community .......... 13

1.3.3 Religious and cultural aspects of organ transplantation.......................... 14

1.3.4 Gender and ethnicity........................................................................ 14

1.3.5 Psychological aspects of organ transplantation.................................... 15

1.3.6 Economic, legal and policy aspects of organ transplantation............... 17

1.3.7 Health education and health literacy and literature............................. 18

1.4 **Ethical aspects of organ transplantation** ............................................. 19

1.4.1 General and cross-cutting issues .................................................... 19

1.4.2 Brain death..................................................................................... 21

1.4.3 Cadaveric organ donation.............................................................. 21

1.4.4 Living organ donation.................................................................... 21

1.4.5 Informed consent and autonomy of the patient................................. 22

1.4.6 Justice, fairness and equity............................................................ 23

1.4.7 Children and organ donation/transplantation.................................... 23
1.4.8 The prisoner’s dilemma: prisoners as organ “donors” and recipients …………………..24
1.4.9 Other issues………………………………………………………………………………………………………24
1.5 To pay or not to pay: the debate on paid organ donation……………………………………..24

2. HUMAN TISSUE: BANKING AND ALLOCATION ……………………………………………………………….27
2.1 Medical and research aspects of tissue procurement and transplantation……………….…….27
  2.1.1 General and cross-cutting issues ……………………………………………………………………………..27
  2.1.2 Eye donation and cornea transplantation…………………………………………………………………27
  2.1.3 Bone tissue transplantation………………………………………………………………………………….27
  2.1.4 Brain tissue transplantation………………………………………………………………………………….28
  2.1.5 Blood donation, haematopoietic stem cells……………………………………………………………..28

2.2 National tissue banks and international tissue banking……………………………………….28
  2.2.1 General and cross-cutting issues ……………………………………………………………………………28
  2.2.2 Bone and musculo-skeletal tissue banking…………………………………………………………….……29
  2.2.3 Brain tissue banking…………………………………………………………………………………………29
  2.2.4 Eye and cornea banking………………………………………………………………………………………30
  2.2.5 Blood donation, haematopoietic stem cell transplantation……………………………………………31

2.3 Ethical, legal and economic aspects of tissue banking and transplantation………………….32
  2.3.1 General and cross-cutting issues ……………………………………………………………………………32
  2.3.2 Legislation and regulation……………………………………………………………………………………32
  2.3.3 Economics and allocation……………………………………………………………………………………33
  2.3.4 Ethics………………………………………………………………………………………………………………34

3. XENOTRANSPLANTATION ………………………………………………………………………………………….35
3.1 History and current issues…………………………………………………………………………………………35
  3.1.1 General and cross-cutting issues………………………………………………………………………………….35
  3.1.2 Research and medical aspects…………………………………………………………………………………36

3.2 Legislation, regulation and ethics………………………………………………………………………………36
  3.2.1 Legislation and regulation……………………………………………………………………………………36
  3.2.2 Ethics………………………………………………………………………………………………………………37

3.3 Animal rights …………………………………………………………………………………………………………38
4. TRANSPANTATION IN A WORLDWIDE PERSPECTIVE ..................................................38

4.1 Organ trafficking and commerce ..........................................................38

4.2 Transplantation in developing countries ..............................................40

4.2.1 General and cross-cutting issues ................................................40

4.2.2 Medical aspects of transplantation in the developing world ..........40

4.2.3 Economical aspects: procurement and allocation of organs and tissue...........41

4.2.4 Social, cultural and gender aspects of transplantation in the developing world......42

4.2.5 Ethics, equity and justice ..........................................................42

4.3 Africa ...............................................................................................43

4.3.1 General .................................................................43

4.3.2 North Africa ..........................................................43

4.3.3 Sub-Saharan Africa ..................................................43

4.3.4 South Africa ..........................................................43

4.4 Asia ...............................................................................................44

4.4.1 General .................................................................44

4.4.2 India, Pakistan ..........................................................44

4.4.3 China, Taiwan ..........................................................45

4.4.4 Japan, Korea ..........................................................46

4.4.5 Philippines ..............................................................47

4.4.6 South-East Asia ..........................................................47

4.5 Australia .......................................................................................47

4.6 Europe ...........................................................................................48

4.6.1 European Union ..........................................................48

4.6.2 Eastern Europe, Russia ..........................................................48

4.6.3 Balkan states, Turkey ..........................................................49

4.7 Middle East .......................................................................................49

4.7.1 General .................................................................49

4.7.2 Iran, Iraq ..............................................................50

4.7.3 Saudia Arabia, Kuwait ..........................................................50
4.7.4 Israel.................................................................................................................................51
4.7.5 Others...............................................................................................................................51
4.8 North America.....................................................................................................................51
4.9 Latin America.....................................................................................................................52
4.9.1 General............................................................................................................................52
4.9.2 Argentina.........................................................................................................................52
4.9.3 Brazil...............................................................................................................................52
4.9.4 Mexico............................................................................................................................53
4.9.5 Others............................................................................................................................53
5. OFFICIAL DOCUMENTS AND STATEMENTS ON TRANSPLANTATION.................................53
5.1 WHO documents.................................................................................................................53
5.2 Official statements, reports and guidelines of national and international committees, organizations, governments and government agencies.................................................................54
5.2.1 General and cross-cutting issues .......................................................................................54
5.2.2 Research..........................................................................................................................54
5.2.3 Organ transplantation.......................................................................................................54
5.2.4 Tissue banking and transplantation ...............................................................................55
5.2.5 Xenotransplantation........................................................................................................55
5.2.6 Comments on international guidelines and reports.........................................................56
1. Organ Transplantation

1.1 Medical aspects of organ transplantation

1.1.1 General and cross-cutting issues


1.1.2 Organ donation from deceased donors vs. living organ donation

a. Organ donation from deceased donors


b. Living organ donation


### 1.1.3 Kidney

#### a. General


#### b. Renal transplantation


### 1.1.4 Liver transplantation


### 1.1.5 Heart and lung transplantation


1.2 Procurement and allocation of organs from living and deceased donors

1.2.1 General


1.2.2 Procurement and allocation of organs: deceased donors


Roth B.J. et al. (2003), “Cadaveric organ donor recruitment at Los Angeles County Hospital: improvement after formation of a structured clinical, educational and administrative service,” Clinical Transplantion 17(suppl. 9):52-7.

1.2.3 Procurement and allocation of organs: living donors


1.3 Social, cultural, psychological, gender, economic, legal and policy aspects of organ transplantation

1.3.1 General and cross-cutting issues


1.3.2 Social aspects of organ transplantation: the family and the community


1.3.3 Religious and cultural aspects of organ transplantation


1.3.4 Gender and ethnicity


### 1.3.5 Psychological and psychiatric aspects of organ transplantation


EUROTOLD project management group (1997), *Questioning attitudes to living donor transplantation: European multicentre study, transplantation of organs from living donors, ethical and legal dimensions.* (Leicester: The Project Management Group EUROTOLD).


**1.3.6 Economic, legal nad ploicy aspects of organ transplantation**


### 1.3.7 Health education and health literacy and literature


1.4 Ethical aspects of organ transplantation

1.4.1 General and cross-cutting issues


Hoffenberg R. et al. (1997), “Should organs from patients in permanent vegetative state be


1.4.2 Brain death (see also 4.4.4 Japan)


1.4.3 Cadaveric organ donation


1.4.4 Living organ donation


1.4.5 Informed consent and autonomy of the patient


1.4.6 Justice, fairness and equity


Douglas D.D. “Should everyone have equal access to organ transplantation? An argument in favor,” Archives of internal medicine 163(16):1883-5; discussion 1885.

1.4.7 Children and organ donation/ transplantation


**1.4.8 The prisoner’s dilemma: prisoners as organ “donors” and recipients**


**1.4.9 Other issues**


**1.5 To pay or not to pay: the debate on paid organ donation**


Transplantation proceedings 36(1):11-3.


2. Human Tissue: banking and allocation

2.1 Medical and research aspects of tissue procurement, banking and transplantation

2.1.1 General and cross-cutting issues


2.1.2 Eye donation and cornea transplantation


2.1.3 Bone tissue transplantation

contaminated with enveloped and non-enveloped viruses,” Biologicals 30(2):125-33.


2.1.4 Brain tissue transplantation


2.1.5 Blood donation, haematopoietic stem cell transplantation

Berdel W.E. et al. (eds.) (2003), Transplantation in hematology and oncology II. (Berlin; New York: Springer).


2.2 National tissue banks and international tissue banking

2.2.1 General and cross-cutting issues

a. Tissue banking in Asia


b. Tissue banking in Europe


c. Tissue banking in the Americas


2.2.2 Bone and musculo-skeltal tissue banking


### 2.2.3 Brain tissue banking


### 2.2.4 Eye donation and cornea banking

#### a. General


#### b. Africa


#### c. Asia


d. Europe


e. The Americas


2.2.5 Blood donation haematopoietic stem cells, ovarian tissue


### 2.3 Ethical, legal and economic aspects of tissue banking and transplantation

#### 2.3.1 General and cross-cutting issues


#### 2.3.2 Legislation and regulation


2.3.3 Economics, procurement and allocation


2.3.4 Ethics

a. General


b. Informed consent


c. Stem cells, blood donation, fetal and ovarian tissue


3. Xenotransplantation

3.1 History and current issues

3.1.1 General and cross-cutting issues


### 3.1.2 Research and medical aspects of xenotransplantation


### 3.2 Legislation, regulation and ethics

#### 3.2.1 Legislation and regulation


### 3.2.2 Ethics


Melo H. et al. (2001), “Ethical and legal issues in xenotransplantation,” *Bioethics* 15(5-


### 3.3 Animal rights


### 4. Organ transplantation in a worldwide perspective

#### 4.1 Organ trafficking and commerce


3. In Swedish.


4.2 Organ transplantation in developing countries

4.2.1 General and cross-cutting issues


4.2.2 Medical aspects of transplantation in the developing world


### 4.2.3 Economical aspects: procurement and allocation of organs and tissue


4.2.4 Social, cultural and gender aspects of transplantation in the developing world


4.2.5 Ethics, equity and justice


### 4.3 Africa

#### 4.3.1 General


#### 4.3.2 North Africa


#### 4.3.3 Sub-Saharan Africa


#### 4.3.4 South Africa

4.4 Asia

4.4.1 General


4.4.2 India, Pakistan

a. India


b. Pakistan


4.4.3 China, Taiwan

a. China

proceedings 24(6):2423-5.


b. Taiwan


4.4.4 Japan, Korea

a. Japan


*b. Korea*


**4.4.5 Philippines, Western Pacific**


**4.4.6 South-East Asia**


**4.5 Australia**


4.6 Europe

4.6.1 European Union


4.6.2 Eastern Europe, Russia


### 4.6.3 Balkan states, Turkey


### 4.7 Middle East

#### 4.7.1 General


4.7.2 Iran, Iraq

a. Iran


b. Iraq


4.7.3 Saudia Arabia, Kuwait

a. Saudia Arabia


*b. Kuwait*


**4.7.4 Israel**


**4.7.5 Others**


**4.8 North America**


4.9 Latin America

4.9.1 General


4.9.2 Argentina


4.9.3 Brazil


Garcia V.D. et al. (1996), “Transplant coordinators in Rio Grande do Sul, Brazil: analysis of
7 years' activities,” *Transplantation proceedings* 28(1):255.


### 4.9.4 Mexico


### 4.9.5 Others


### 5. Documents, reports and guidelines on transplantation

#### 5.1 WHO documents


### 5.2 Official statements, reports and guidelines of national and international committees, organizations, governments and government agencies

#### 5.2.1 General and cross-cutting issues


Council of Europe (2003), *Convention for the protection of Human Rights and dignity of the human being with regard to the application of biology and medicine: Convention on Human Rights and Biomedicine*. (Strasbourg: Council of Europe Publ.).


#### 5.2.2 Research


#### 5.2.3 Organ transplantation


5.2.4 Tissue banking and transplantation


Council of Europe (2002), *Guide to safety and quality assurance for organs, tissues and cells.* (Strasbourg : Council of Europe Publ.).


5.2.5 Xenotransplantation


U.S. Department of Health and Human Services, Center for Disease Control and Prevention (CDC), *U.S. public health service guideline on infectious disease issues in xenotransplantation.* (Atlanta, GA: The Center).

5.2.6 Comments on international guidelines and reports
