
Joint WHO / World Bank Group Discussion Paper
January 2013
Outline

• Process

• Definition /Principles

• Methods & measures

• Global and Country Monitoring
Process

• Framework builds upon:
  – Informal consultations with representatives of Member States and others
  – Technical meetings in past 2 years: Rotterdam, Washington DC, Bellagio, Dhaka

• Ongoing work:
  – case studies with researchers and MOH in 14 countries + technical contributions (to be published as PLoS Collection)

• Discussion paper on the web
  – Launched Dec 6 in Tokyo
  – Consultation until 15 Feb 2014
  – Face to face consultations

• Revised version ready by mid-March
  – Currently not on agenda of WHA or other governing body
Definitions/Principles
Universal health coverage
Definition and dimensions

• Definition: all people who need health receive them, without undue financial hardship

• Monitoring along three dimensions of UHC:
  – the full spectrum of quality health services according to need
  – financial protection from direct payment for health services when consumed
  – coverage for the entire population

Towards universal coverage
Framework - Bringing together global and country perspectives

Global

- One monitoring framework, one common small set of targets and indicators (or index)
- Regular standardized reporting and review of progress using the common indicators

Country

- No one-size-fits-all approach, but use of flexible global framework and guidance
- Country monitoring based on adapted set of tracer indicators ("progressive realization of UHC")
- Monitoring UHC aligned with country mechanisms of review of progress
Guiding principles for framework

• **Comprehensive**: two inter-related, but separate, UHC measures:
  – essential health services coverage for the population
  – financial protection coverage for the population.

• Encompass the full population **across the life cycle**, inclusive of all ages and gender.

• **Capture all levels of the health system**

• **Equity**: disaggregation by socioeconomic strata to assess the degree to which service and financial protection coverage are equitably distributed
HEALTH GOAL
Maximizing healthy lives at all stages of life

DEVELOPMENT GOAL
Sustainable wellbeing for all

Health Goals in the Post 2015 Development Agenda

- Health
- Wealth, gender equity, education, nutrition, environmental, security etc.
- Accelerate the MDG agenda
- Reduce the NCD burden
- Ensure Universal Health Coverage
- Contributions of other sectors to health
The Emerging Context of the Post 2015 Development Goals

• Eliminating Extreme Poverty
  – Financial protection + coverage of health services matter!

• Growing demand for UHC as a goal

• Two priority groups of health conditions
  – MDGs: infectious killers, MNCH focus
  – Chronic Conditions and Injuries (CCIs): mainly affecting adolescents, adults + elderly

• Consensus on measures: MDGs, CCIs

• Hardwiring of equity into all targets
  – 40% lowest part of income distribution, gender etc.
Methods
Many possible interventions for countries to monitor: progressive realization

Many coverage and risk factor reduction indicators: Countdown 2015 for MNCH, Commissions, UNGASS, NCDs, WHA, etc.

But also many gaps, especially for treatment

**CRITERIA FOR INDICATOR SELECTION**

- **Relevance**: addresses health priority, is a cost-effective intervention
- **Quality**: "effective" coverage
- **Availability**: standard methods, measured on regular basis, disaggregation possible, comparable
- **Equity**: disaggregation possible
- **Potential cost** of the intervention to the user
Full spectrum of interventions addressing health needs

Communicable, maternal, perinatal, nutritional conditions (MDGs)

Promotion and prevention
- Family planning
- Pregnancy care
- Immunization
- Water & sanitation
- Nutrition
- HIV
- Malaria
- Neglected Tropical Diseases

Treatment & care
- Delivery
- Sick children
- HIV
- TB
- Malaria
- NTD

Non-communicable diseases, mental health, injuries (CCIs)

Promotion and prevention
- Non-communicable diseases (NCD), including cancer
- Mental health
- Injury
- Occupational health
- Environmental health

Treatment & care
- NCD, including cancer
- Mental health conditions
- Injury
- Rehabilitation
- Palliation

Indicators of intervention coverage among population in need (with equity and quality ("effective coverage") dimensions)
Examples of indicators of promotion, prevention, treatment

- **MDG**: antenatal care (1 and 4+ visits), skilled birth attendance, child immunization, family planning need satisfied, ART, TB treatment, ITN coverage for malaria (if relevant)

- **Chronic conditions & injuries**: non-use of tobacco, coverage of hypertension treatment, diabetes treatment, vision correction

- **Treatment indicators** — difficult to determine population need:
  - Treatment of acute illnesses in children (diarrhoea, pneumonia)
  - Treatment of common chronic conditions such as angina, depression, chronic respiratory diseases etc.
  - Surgical treatment: cardiac revascularization procedures, hip replacement, knee replacement, cataract surgery etc.
Communicating progress

The elevator test

• A composite measure for two groups e.g. MDG and CCI?

• A few tracer indicators?

• A multitude of indicators?
Composite Measure of Service Coverage

- Two groups of interventions
  - MDGs and CCIs

- Two broad age groups
  - mothers/children and adults/elderly

- Two levels of the health system
  - population/ambulatory; facility-based

- Weighting in Aggregation
  - Equal weight to interventions, intervention areas, intervention groups
  - Unequal weight according to e.g. preventable burden
Two measures of financial protection coverage

• Incidence of **catastrophic out-of-pocket spending**, i.e. spending exceeding a threshold of a household's 'ability-to-pay’

• Incidence of 'impoverishment' arising from out-of-pocket spending

Both measures: re-scaled to 100%:
- 100% = no catastrophic expenditure
- 100% = no impoverishing payments
Equity Measures

• UHC is fundamentally about equity – all people get what they need and all people protected from financial risk

• Equity measures for service coverage and financial protection
  – Focus on coverage in poorest 40% (WB "shared prosperity" goal)
  – Recognize other equity dimensions also important for countries
Targets

• **Services Coverage: “80 / 40”**
  – At least 80% service coverage in poorest 40%

• **“Zero Financial Risk”:**
  – 100% financial risk protection from impoverishing expenditures
UHC Measures
Example: Coverage of Services for MDGs and CCIs – related Intervention (WHS 2002-03)

Coverage of Services for MDG and CCI, by Region

Source: World Health Surveys.
MDG tracers: Treatment of ARI, diarrhea, malaria and TB; Voluntary counseling and testing for HIV; Full immunization; 4+ antenatal visits; Skilled birth attendance.
CCI tracers: Care within 30 mins. of traffic and non-traffic accident; Treatment of angina, arthritis, asthma, dental problems, depression, diabetes, and mental illness; Mammogram; Pap Smear; Cataract removal.
Example: Financial protection indicators by region (WHS 2002-03)

Financial Protection Indicators
By region

- East Asia & Pacific
- Europe & Central Asia
- Latin America & Caribbean
- Middle East & North Africa
- South Asia
- Sub-Saharan Africa

% Population protected

- Catastrophic payments (pop)
- Catastrophic payments (poorest 40%)
- Impoverishment (pop)

Source: World Health Surveys.
Prot. against catastrophic payments: % population not spending >25% of nonfood consumption on health care.
Prot. against impoverishment: poverty gap ($1.25 poverty line) without OOP as a % of actual poverty gap.
Country monitoring of MDG and CCI indicators: example of national data, Ghana

**MDG**
-平均: 60%

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Indicator</th>
<th>Average</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Immunization</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Child nutrition</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TB control</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maternal &amp; newborn care</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HIV control</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Treatment sick children</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Water &amp; sanitation</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Malaria control</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Family planning</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**CCI**
-平均: 47%

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Indicator</th>
<th>Average</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Behavioural risk factors</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Biological risk factors</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ambulant care</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cancer screening &amp; prevention</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In-patient care</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Global Monitoring
Global level monitoring

• One Goal:
  – Reach UHC by 2030 in all countries – all people have access to the quality, essential services they need without financial hardship

• Two Targets:
  – By 2030: at least 80% of the poorest 40% of the population have coverage to ensure access to essential health services.
  – By 2030: everyone (100%) has coverage to protect them from financial risk, so that no one is pushed into poverty or kept in poverty because of expenditure on health services.

  • Intermediate targets: e.g. by 2020 half the number of persons who become impoverished (from 100m to 50m per year)
Global level monitoring proposals (1)

• Three indicators of Financial Risk Protection Coverage:
  
  – Impoverishing Expenditure:
    • Aggregate: a measure of the level of household impoverishment arising from out-of-pocket expenditures on health, equal to the ratio of the poverty gap in a world without out-of-pocket payments to the actual (larger) poverty gap.
  
  – Catastrophic Expenditure:
    • Aggregate: the fraction of households incurring catastrophic out-of-pocket health expenditures.
    • Equity: the fraction of households among the poorest 40% of the population incurring catastrophic out-of-pocket health expenditure.
Global level monitoring proposals (2)

Four Indicators of Health Services Coverage:

- MDGs
  1. *Aggregate*: a measure of MDG-related service coverage that is an aggregate of single intervention coverage measures for the health MDGs
  2. *Equity*: A measure of MDG-related service coverage for the poorest 40% of the population.

- CCIs
  1. *Aggregate*: a measure of CCIs-related service coverage that is an aggregate of single priority interventions to address the burden of non-communicable diseases, including mental health and injuries.
  2. *Equity*: a measure of CCI service coverage for the poorest 40% of the population.
Country Monitoring
Country monitoring

• Framed within overall health systems progress and performance assessment: includes more on inputs, access, quality, health impact and determinants on health

• Additional coverage indicators included as country progresses on the road to UHC

• Equity stratifiers included as locally relevant

• Investments in monitoring systems needed:
  – regular comprehensive household surveys
  – good quality, timely, health facility data
Further Information

• Discussion Paper available at:
  http://www.who.int/healthinfo/country_monitoring_evaluation/universal_health_coverage/en/

• Comments to:
  uhcmonitoring@who.int or HNPfeedback@worldbank.org
Thank You