Economically sustainable alternatives to tobacco growing (in relation to Articles 17 and 18 of the WHO FCTC)

Report by the Convention Secretariat

INTRODUCTION

1. At the sixth session (Moscow, Russia, 13–18 October 2014), the Conference of the Parties (COP) adopted decision FCTC/COP6(11) entitled “Economically sustainable alternatives to tobacco growing (in relation to Articles 17 and 18 of the WHO FCTC): report by the working group”. The COP requested the Convention Secretariat to:

   a) support interested Parties in developing pilot projects and other initiatives that aim to implement these policy options and recommendations;

   b) promote international cooperation and exchange of information among interested parties;

   c) organize an international database, within the WHO FCTC information platform, of good practices, instruments and measures to support the implementation of these policy options and recommendations;

   d) invite support and collaboration from Parties and competent international organizations including WHO to raise awareness of the health, environmental and social harms and risks related to tobacco cultivation and manufacture and to promote the implementation of Articles 17 and 18 of the WHO FCTC in all relevant forums, including the discussion of the post-2015 development agenda;

   e) invite the Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations (FAO) to update its 2003 study “Projections of Tobacco Production, Consumption and Trade”, considering the impact of the implementation of the WHO FCTC;

   f) invite the International Labour Organization to update data on jobs related to tobacco production and manufacturing in order to support Parties to the WHO FCTC to monitor the potential impact of the Convention on the livelihoods of tobacco growers and the economies of tobacco-growing regions;

   g) cooperate with FAO, in the context of the International Year of Family Farming, to support initiatives aimed at promoting alternatives to tobacco growing;
h) request WHO to support interested Parties to develop guidelines for surveillance, prevention and early diagnosis of occupational harms and risks specific to tobacco cultivation and manufacture, in particular those related to green tobacco sickness;

i) submit to COP7, a progress report on the implementation of the current decision. The progress report can make use of experiences and case studies from before and after this decision.

2. This decision follows previous discussions initiated in the first session of COP (COP1) that are reflected in decisions FCTC/COP1(17), FCTC/COP2(13), FCTC/COP3(16), FCTC/COP4(9), FCTC/COP5(8) and FCTC/COP6(11). In line with these discussions and in accordance with decision FCTC/COP6(11), this document describes the activities undertaken by the Convention Secretariat since the last COP session in regard to the implementation of Articles 17 and 18.

3. The Convention Secretariat is in the process of establishing mechanisms to ensure that assistance is provided. This report discusses ongoing activities, which include: raising awareness on the need for implementation of Article 17 and 18 provisions; identifying experts and academic institutions to support research and implementation; establishing cooperation with specialized agencies and programmes; preparing a database with relevant documents; and identifying, commissioning and sharing best practice in order to respond to requests. Furthermore, the Convention Secretariat will explore the possibility of identifying a Knowledge Hub that can support in compiling evidence and providing assistance.

4. Since these are two of the least implemented articles of the Convention, this is an area where greater effort needs to be focused for the identification of best practice and the sharing of experience, because the tobacco industry continues to argue that demand-reduction measures under the WHO FCTC will swiftly extinguish the economic benefits of tobacco growing to local and national economies, reduce employment and damage national economies. In reality, annual consumption usually decreases by fractions of percentage points, thus allowing growers to gradually diversify into other activities as government adjustment programmes are implemented. Mechanization of tobacco growing and competition in international trade generally bear much more responsibility for decreasing employment. Therefore, the tobacco industry’s claims are incorrect. Moreover, Parties are required to protect the implementation of Articles 17 and 18 of the WHO FCTC against the commercial and vested interests of the tobacco industry in accordance with Article 5.3 of the Convention and the guidelines for its implementation. Parties report that key challenges for the implementation of these Articles include the scarcity of information on specific programmes and relevant research, and the need for strengthened platforms for information sharing among interested Parties.

ASSISTANCE TO PARTIES IN THE IMPLEMENTATION OF ARTICLES 17 AND 18 AND PILOT PROJECTS

5. Support to Parties for the implementation of Articles 17 and 18 is considered by the Convention Secretariat either when directly requested by a Party, or as a result of joint needs assessment missions.

6. While implementation of Articles 17 and 18 is reported to be a priority by a number of Parties, the average implementation rate for Article 17 was 12% in 2014 and 18% in 2016, while the average implementation rate for Article 18 was 23% in 2014 and 24% in 2016. Direct requests for assistance were only received by the Convention Secretariat as part of the South-South and Triangular cooperation initiatives described in document FCTC/COP/7/17.

7. Joint needs assessment missions with 40 Parties have identified four Parties which considered the need to implement Article 17 and 18 provisions among their priorities and expressed an interest in receiving assistance.
8. One example resulted from a recent needs assessment mission to Lebanon. It was noted that currently there are government incentives for tobacco growing and no promotion of economically viable and sustainable alternatives for tobacco growers, workers or individual tobacco sellers. The Convention Secretariat discussed with the Lebanese Ministry of Agriculture, the country office in Lebanon of the Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations (FAO), the United Nations Development Programme (UNDP) and WHO on how to provide technical and financial support for a pilot project on alternative livelihoods for tobacco farmers in Lebanon\(^1\).

**INTERNATIONAL COOPERATION: SOUTH-SOUTH AND TRIANGULAR COOPERATION**

9. From 29 September–1 October 2016, the Convention Secretariat, in collaboration with UNDP, organized a South-South and Triangular cooperation meeting in Montevideo, Uruguay. As a result of this meeting an international cooperation project on the implementation of Articles 17 and 18 was identified and a project proposal was presented to the Convention Secretariat\(^2\).

10. The project sought to design country-specific action plans for recipient countries to develop programmes on alternative livelihoods. Brazil was identified as the country provider of assistance and agreed to share its experience on the National Diversification programme for the implementation of WHO FCTC Article 17 with Jamaica, the Philippines and Uruguay.

11. A study visit to Brazil was then organized. Prior to the visit, each recipient country reported on its current situation, including details of the tobacco growing sector, social programmes and existing agricultural programmes, as well as other aspects related to the implementation of Articles 17 and 18. A collaborative platform was also established and Brazil shared relevant background materials including case studies and technical manuals.

12. The purpose of the study visit was to demonstrate approaches for diversification in tobacco growing areas, based on the experience of Brazil over the past 15 years and on the livelihood methodology adopted at the Sixth Conference of the Parties (COP6) in Russia.

13. Field visits took place in the municipalities of Nova Trento and Leoberto Leal in Santa Catarina, where the Brazilian Ministry of Agrarian Development has run diversification programmes in partnership with the Centre for Studies and Promotion of Group Agriculture since 2005, when Brazil ratified the treaty and the National Programme of Diversification in Areas of Tobacco Cultivation was created.

14. After the study visit the group concluded that the existence of public policies to meet the challenges of implementing Articles 17 and 18 is critical to support farmers so that they can securely invest in other forms of agriculture. Policies should include access to credit, access to institutional markets, technical assistance, organization of growers’ cooperatives, value addition and provision of infrastructure.

15. Jamaica, the Philippines and Uruguay were then encouraged to develop, with technical support from Brazil, a programme proposal for the implementation of Articles 17 and 18 based on the

---

\(^1\) This project will be financially supported by the European Union Commission.

\(^2\) The South-South meeting and the project on Articles 17 and 18 were financially supported by the European Union Commission.
experience acquired and to submit this to their governments. The three countries were also encouraged to develop pilot projects and present them to the Convention Secretariat.\(^3\)

16. The Ministry of Agriculture together with the Ministry of Health and the Municipality of Ilocos Norte in the Philippines have already developed a project and will conduct a pilot study on alternative livelihoods.

**KNOWLEDGE MANAGEMENT: DATABASE**

17. A number of publications describing good practice, instruments and measures to support the implementation of these policy options and recommendations can be accessed at the Implementation Database of the Convention Secretariat.\(^4\)

18. The Convention Secretariat is developing, within the WHO FCTC information platform, a section on assistance to Parties. The objective is to provide a coordination platform to bring together and strengthen collaboration between Parties, international, intergovernmental and nongovernmental organizations (IGOs and NGOs) and other organizations that provide or could provide resources and technical assistance.

19. The new database will include a dynamic platform for Parties requiring technical or financial resources to execute projects, or to develop or implement policies, among other needs. Interested Parties would post their requirements and supporting organizations could respond with offers of assistance or funding. These organizations would also be able to post details of funding opportunities or other types of support.

20. The database will also include a platform of resources for the implementation of WHO FCTC and a section managed by the Convention Secretariat where calls for proposals, new funding opportunities, training, and other forms of support would be announced. Parties will also be able to access information about how to contact and seek assistance from staff members of the Convention Secretariat responsible for different articles of the Convention.

21. Through this special section of the WHO FCTC information platform, Parties, the Convention Secretariat and other partners will be able to share established good practice, request and offer assistance, and promote instruments and measures to support policy options and recommendations for the implementation of Articles 17 and 18 of the Convention.

**AWARENESS RAISING**

22. The Convention Secretariat has consistently raised awareness of the health, environmental and social harm and risks related to tobacco cultivation and manufacture, and to promote the implementation of Articles 17 and 18 of the WHO FCTC in all relevant forums, including discussion on the post-2015 development agenda.

23. This work includes raising this topic in forums such as the World Conference on Tobacco or Health, a meeting of experts in Delhi, India, among other scientific and academic forums, and

---

\(^3\) These projects will be financially supported by the European Union Commission.

\(^4\) Available at [http://apps.who.int/fctc/implementation/database/article/article-17/resources](http://apps.who.int/fctc/implementation/database/article/article-17/resources) and [http://apps.who.int/fctc/implementation/database/article/article-18/resources](http://apps.who.int/fctc/implementation/database/article/article-18/resources)
publishing scientific papers. In 2015, the Convention Secretariat co-authored a scientific article on the environmental and health impact of tobacco agriculture, cigarette manufacture and consumption published in the Bulletin of the World Health Organization. The paper detailed the environmental impact of the tobacco life-cycle and suggested policy responses 5.

24. As a member of the United Nations Interagency Task Force on the Prevention and Control of NCDs (UNIATF), the Convention Secretariat has raised the importance of policy options and recommendations for the implementation of Articles 17 and 18, specifically regarding the sustainable development agenda. As previously mentioned, awareness was also raised through the South-South and Triangular Cooperation meeting held in Uruguay.

25. The Convention Secretariat is exploring ways to cooperate with the United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change (UNFCCC) Secretariat in order to engage in joint initiatives to address the health, environmental and social harm and risks related to tobacco cultivation and manufacture, including their impact on climate change.

26. The Convention Secretariat has also promoted the importance of the implementation of Articles 17 and 18 in all needs assessment missions, highlighting policy options and recommendations and providing technical and financial support when needed. The topics have also been discussed at regional and subregional workshops and other events jointly organized by the Convention Secretariat.

COOPERATION WITH INTERGOVERNMENTAL ORGANIZATIONS

27. Along with the cooperation with UNDP on needs assessment missions and South-South and triangular collaboration projects, the Convention Secretariat has initiated contacts with appropriate IGOs to support various initiatives on alternatives to tobacco growing in line with Articles 17 and 18 of the treaty, its policy options and recommendations and the requests from the COP.

Cooperation with FAO

28. The Convention Secretariat has invited FAO to update its 2003 study “Projections of Tobacco Production, Consumption and Trade”, considering the impact of the implementation of the WHO FCTC and an agreement has been signed for the performance of this work. The Convention Secretariat will continue to follow up and will disseminate this information as soon as available. The Convention Secretariat has also shared the list of Parties which have requested support for the implementation of economically sustainable alternatives to tobacco growing, enabling FAO to offer support at the national level.

Collaboration with UNCTAD

29. The Convention Secretariat has engaged with the United Nations Conference on Trade and Development (UNCTAD) to elaborate a report which maps the tobacco global value chain in low-income countries. The objective is to use a global value chains (GVC) analysis to understand how the changing dynamics of the global tobacco industry are affecting producers in low-income countries that are heavily reliant on the tobacco industry. The publication identifies trends in tobacco production, trade and demand, and provides recommendations on trade policy, diversification, and crop substitution.

5 Available at http://www.who.int/bulletin/volumes/93/12/15-152744.pdf
Collaboration with ILO

30. The International Labour Organization (ILO) has updated data on jobs related to tobacco production and manufacturing. The Organization launched a publication entitled Tobacco Sector-Employment Statistical Update, which aims to provide a global statistical overview of the current employment situation both in tobacco growing and manufacturing. The information in this document reflects official data as reported by competent and specialized authorities in each country.6

31. ILO will continue collecting relevant employment data for the tobacco sector in order to monitor significant changes in employment trends and working conditions. The Convention Secretariat will collaborate to ensure frequent statistical updates to provide Parties to the WHO FCTC with critical data for self-analysis.

Cooperation with WHO

32. The Convention Secretariat has coordinated efforts and worked closely with WHO headquarters in Geneva and with its teams at the regional and country offices. Together with the Prevention of Noncommunicable Diseases Department, the Convention Secretariat is working to raise awareness about the environmental and health impact of tobacco agriculture, cigarette manufacture and consumption. The Convention Secretariat has been working with WHO on the development of a monograph on tobacco and the environment. A workshop on the writing of this paper took place in June 2016 and involved a variety of partners.

33. The Convention Secretariat has also engaged with the Public Health, Environmental and Social Determinants of Health Department to discuss the role of the health system in encouraging behavioural change, and towards the adoption of policies for environmental sustainability.

34. The Convention Secretariat helped to disseminate Status of Tobacco Production and Trade in Africa - Factsheets, a publication jointly launched by UNCTAD and WHO in December 2015. The country factsheets on tobacco production and trade include trends in current tobacco use, tobacco production, crop yield, and tobacco trade (including tariff and non-tariff measures). The aim is to enable policy-makers and public health experts to develop a better understanding of the impact of trade liberalization on the domestic production and consumption of tobacco, but also of tobacco control measures such as WHO FCTC in the African continent.

35. In 2016, UNCTAD and WHO expanded the scope of this work by developing factsheets for all countries in the world. These data are available to the general public on the website of WHO and should support the implementation of Articles 17 and 18 by providing information on tobacco production, consumption and trade. The Convention Secretariat also disseminated this publication and a video entitled Alternative Livelihood for Tobacco Farmers in South-East Asia, produced by the WHO Regional Office for South-East Asia and the World Lung Foundation.7

Collaboration with the European Commission

36. The Convention Secretariat invited the European Commission to gather information concerning progress on the implementation of Articles 17 and 18 by those EU member states which produce raw tobacco.

7 Available at https://www.youtube.com/watch?feature=player_embedded&v=iMqu1NGLPjI
37. The resulting document from the Directorate-General for Agriculture and Rural Development of the European Commission presents a picture of raw tobacco production in the EU, its evolution during the last decade and the measures referred to or implemented by member states. It also explains the two main financial tools of the EU Common Agricultural Policy (CAP) – the direct payment scheme and rural development programmes. As the report shows, the majority of the CAP measures are implemented by the member states without any distinction regarding the crops or sector, and therefore many member states could not provide detailed figures solely for the tobacco sector.

OCCUPATIONAL HARM AND RISKS SPECIFIC TO TOBACCO CULTIVATION AND MANUFACTURE

38. Considering the decisions and recommendations adopted by COP6, the Convention Secretariat has engaged with the government of Brazil through the Centre for the Study of Tobacco and Health of the Oswaldo Cruz Foundation (FIOCRUZ) in order to develop a comprehensive health care protocol to monitor tobacco growers’ health. This will be developed to guide action related to health care management, as well as action to promote, protect, and ensure surveillance of tobacco growers’ health problems.

39. Moreover, the project also includes the establishment of a health education programme addressed to tobacco growers and civil society organizations in tobacco growing areas. This programme will encompass the problems faced by growers in tobacco farming areas, as well as environmental impact and social problems (including poverty, human rights violations, and other issues). Both strategies are complementary and will be valuable in strengthening the implementation of article 18 of WHO FCTC in Brazil and among other Parties to the Convention.

ACTION BY THE CONFERENCE OF THE PARTIES

40. The COP is invited to note this report and provide further guidance.

---

8 This project is financially supported by the European Union Commission.