WHO Conference on Health Aspects of Tsunami Disaster in Asia

Policy and Coordination

Richard Garfield, RN, DrPH
Columbia University
Models and Lessons

- **Disasters:**
  - Orissa SuperCyclone and Floods
  - Bam Earthquake 2003
  - Gujarat Earthquake 2001

- **Multilateral Evaluations:**
  - Hurricane Mitch, Central America 1998
  - Great Lakes Region, Africa 2003

- **Asian Financial Crisis** 1997 -
Major Lessons

• Much Assistance Which is Too Late to be Effective
  Ex: Surgical Supplies Arrive After Surgeries are Finished

• More Competition than Coordination Among UN Agencies

• No Lead Agency or Other Agencies Unwilling to be Led

• Actions were Donor Driven, Rather than Need, Driven

• Many NGOs, Much Overlap, Limited Relevant Expertise

• Internationals Doing Some Jobs Better Done by Locals

• Recovery, Resilience, and Preparedness Depends on Developing Local Capacity

• More Accountable to Donors than Beneficiaries
UN Relations With Local Authorities

- UN Effectiveness Limited Where No Government or Governance Under Duress
- In Such Situations, Need for Peacekeeping or Peace Enforcement
- Ambivalent Relations Between Humanitarian and Security Roles
- Humanitarian Space Further Constrained post 9/11, especially in Afghanistan and Iraq
Vulnerabilities, Needs, and Abilities Vary

GDP per capita 1995
Number of People Killed in Conflicts, 1995-2001, by HDI Level, In thousands
Number of Displaced People and Refugees, 1996 – 2002 by HDI Level, In thousands
What is Policy

• Define Needs
• Set Goals
• Prioritize and Coordinate Actions
• Monitor Resource Allocation
• Analyze Impact
• Establish Accountability
What is Coordination

• Allocate Tasks to Maximize Complimentarity
• Harmonize Procedures
• Produce Relevant Information
• Plan Strategies
• Manage Information
• Balance Focus on Relief, Recovery, and Development
The Problems

• Planning should be strategic, usually is contingent

• Data is usually not relevant, timely, agreed upon, used, or turned into information useful for action

• Accountable to whom?
• In health, we know how to collect and analyze disease data. We create rates for events and measure rate changes. We know if something has changed and can often track the impact of our actions.

• With rare geophysical phenomena, it is much harder to know if we prevented or mitigated something.
While devotees at the shrine of coordination are legion….there is little understanding of why the effective orchestration of their activities proves so difficult.”

Larry Minear, *Learning the Lessons*
• Approach every crisis as unique
• Action-oriented nature
• Inadequate authority to command
• Feast and famine in funding
• Defensiveness toward criticism
• Self-evaluated
• Lack of accountability
Community Development Approach

Send Goods

Provide Services

Coordinate Services

Assist Locals to Provide Services
• Usually Top-Down

In Emergency
When Technology Highly Specialized
When no Local Authority to Coordinate With
When Security Poor
In Camp Situation

• Moving to Bottom-Up

In Recovery and Development
With Community Resources
In Stable Situations
Where Ample Capacity
With large Settled Populations - Coordination Needed Here!
• More Top Down
  Mass Casualties
  Surveillance
  Forensics

• More Bottom-Up
  Recovery of Health Systems
  Strengthening Health Worker Capacity
  Disaster Reduction
Trade and Development Assistance (2003)

US Total Contributions to the United Nations: $3 billion
Private Charitable Contributions to NGOs: $6 billion
US Development Assistance: $16.3 billion
Remittances: $27.9 billion
Trade (US net imports) $309 billion
Tools for Coordination

- Principles of Engagement
- Protocols for Assumption of Responsibility
- Minimum Data Set for Monitoring
- Health Sector Component Summaries
- GIS Systems Coordination
- Surveillance and Monitoring Data Systems
The Future

• More Geothermal Events, Rising Sea Levels

• Rapid Urbanization in Marginal Areas

• Economic Growth without Urban Planning
“Most of all, if gains in health and nutrition during emergencies are to be sustained, graduates need to understand the importance of capacity building of national staff and institutions. The changing nature and focus of complex emergencies from short-term emergencies in refugee camps to prolonged emergencies in large geographical areas needs a profound shift in focus.”

Salama et al, Lessons Learned from Complex Emergencies