Findings of the Joint Action on European Health Workforce Planning and Forecasting and its Continuation

Eszter Kovacs, PhD, Edmond Girasek, PhD, Miklos Szocska, PhD
Health Services Management Training Centre
Semmelweis University, Hungary
Joint Action on European HWF Planning and Forecasting

- provide a platform for collaboration and exchange between stakeholders
- prepare better Europe’s future health workforce
- improve the capacity for health workforce planning and forecasting
- support collaboration and exchanges between MS and by providing state-of-the-art knowledge on quantitative and qualitative planning

Grant Agreement Number: JA EUHWF 20122201
• Investigated several aspects of HWF planning and revealed country practices with participation of more than 90 partners in 2013-2016.
• Triangulated research methodology and policy focused discussions were used to explore the complexity of different HWF planning systems and to develop recommendations and useful tools for stakeholders.
The findings showed
1. HWF planning is a complex activity where planning processes and planning data need to be studied together, due to their mutual close connection and interdependency, both have a significant influence on data quality and systematic HWF planning activities.

2. Five key elements describe planning systems: goals, forecasting model, data, link to policy actions and organization.
Forces shaping and challenging the sustainability of the health labour market

External challenges:
- Population ageing
- Changing care demands
- Migration patterns
- Budget restraints
- Technological innovations
- Etc.

Internal challenges
- Workforce ageing
- Recruitment & retention
- Skills mismatches
- Geographic maldistribution
- Etc.

Health Workforce Planning and Forecasting

Effective, accessible and resilient health systems
Context of Planning activities

Processes (e.g., data collection, data reporting, data management, data flows) of HWF planning

Data (e.g., data sources, datasets, data categories, methodology) available for HWF planning

Reports available: http://healthworkforce.eu/work-package-4/
The findings showed
1. HWF planning is a complex activity where planning processes and planning data need to be studied together, due to their mutual close connection and interdependency, both have a significant influence on data quality and systematic HWF planning activities.

2. Five key elements describe planning systems: goals, forecasting model, data, link to policy actions and organization.
Reports available: http://healthworkforce.eu/work-package
EU handbook on planning methodology
http://hwf-handbook
Seven Ms were deeply investigated and 2 pilot projects in Italy and Portugal

- In Italy - stakeholder engagement and involvement showed important results towards standard planning methodology in the regions

- In Portugal - development of HWF Planning data warehouse started, an individual register of the National Inventory of Health Professionals was developed based on minimum planning data requirements
How do we know where we are? Where to start the interventions and developments?

http://hwftoolkit.semmelweis.hu

Reports available: http://healthworkforce.eu/work-package-4/
This self-evaluation toolkit is a practical collection of tools addressing major topics in health workforce planning, adaptable for different country environments and facilitating the implementation of minimal steps to enable improvement.
Meet Captain Planning,
who will guide you through this webportal. Captain Planning will instruct you on your health workforce planning self-evaluation journey, and tell you how to complete different tools or advice you what to do next.

JOIN NOW
The findings showed
3. Harmonized international terminology and precise definitions can give guidance for Member States for system improvements
4. Minimum data requirement for planning can be defined, where objectives of data collections must be known

5. Data collection according to qualifications is more supportive for planning, as it can be linked easily to the interventions at the level of education
6. Regarding activity categories, licensed to practice and practicing data can also add valuable information for planning. Producing data closest to practicing category is recommended.
### Clues of data collections

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Supply</th>
<th>Demand</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Labour force</td>
<td>Training</td>
<td>Retirement</td>
<td>Migration inflow</td>
<td>Migration outflow</td>
<td>Population</td>
<td>Health consumption</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Profession</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>8</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Head count</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>8</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FTE</td>
<td>7</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Geographic area</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>7</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Specialisation</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Country of first qualification</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gender</td>
<td>10</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Data collection according
Continuum of data collection objectives

First level objective
To gain awareness of the stock;
To identify the current stock of active and inactive health professionals;
To sustain the stock

Second level objective
To monitor changes of the stock by
a) Supply based approach
b) Demand based approach
These contribute to providing awareness of imbalances and to overcome gaps and difficulties

Third level objective
Complex forecasting and planning including several variables that have influence on HWF issues;
To sustain the system by adapting the production, managing the migration, applying retention and recruitment mechanisms influencing the Full-Time Equivalent

Planning purposes?

Qualifications is more supported
The findings showed

3. Harmonized international terminology and precise definitions can give guidance for Member States for system improvements

4. Minimum data requirement for planning can be defined, where objectives of data collections must be known

5. Data collection according to qualifications is more supportive for planning, as it can be linked easily to the interventions at the level of education

6. Regarding activity categories, licensed to practice and practicing data can also add valuable information for planning. Producing data closest to practicing category is recommended.
The findings showed that 7. Mobility influences the overall picture, managing brain drain and reliance on foreign HWF requires comprehensive assessment of mobility, therefore particular attention should be dedicated to data collections, automatic international data exchange and monitoring mobility indicators. 8. Outflow indicators in the source countries and inflow indicators in the destination countries should be compared in order to achieve better measurements, which could support decision-makers in finding the necessary points for intervention.

Reports available: [http://healthworkforce.eu/work-package-4/](http://healthworkforce.eu/work-package-4/)
Recommended indicator set for measuring health workforce outflow

- Source country flow information
- Annual number of health professionals with passive intention to leave
- Annual number of health professionals with intention to leave and becoming inactive
- Source country flow and stock information
- Destination country flow information
- Annual number of emigrant health professionals
- Number of emigrant health professionals
- Destination country stock information
The results also called the attention to horizon scanning methodology that shows the benefits of qualitative data in HWF planning, therefore the collection of qualitative data should be channeled into HWF planning.

Horizon scanning is a complex system analysis applied in a national-specific context that aims to investigate workforce systems, factors, forces and their inter-relations, and drivers of change for the future in workforce systems, - e.g., population level, healthcare services and HWF characteristics – that was piloted in the GP workforce in Belgium.

Recommendations for other countries considering using horizon scanning and Delphi method in the future

These methods are flexible, adaptable and can be used for workforce futures research projects, as well as wider health system evolution investigations. Some guidance and advice is provided below:

---

6. Ensure the overall planning, timing and budget of the work is realistic. Learn from others who have used these methods as part of workforce reviews.

5. Ensure stakeholders are involved in every stage of the workforce review including modelling and variable validation (CfWI, 2015)

4. Ensure that the persons using horizon scanning or Delphi method have or access some proven experience and expertise (or access to people that do) in workforce planning.

---

1. Set goals and objectives of the workforce review to be completed. What is the priority? What time frame or depth will the review go to?

2. Understand the context of the system to be investigated, ensuring the that appropriate methods are selected for workforce planning (Fellows and Edwards, 2014).

3. Use the selected techniques as part of an overall approach. Ensure that horizon scanning and Delphi method is strongly linked to all stages.
And now...
The action continues - Supported by the EU Health Programme

No. Chafea/2016/Health/18. tender
“Support for the hEalth workforce Planning and forecasting Expert Network
Service contract nr. 2016 7301

AIM:
to sustain cross-country cooperation and provide support to Member States to increase their knowledge, improve their tools and succeed in achieving a higher effectiveness in health workforce planning processes and policy.
It will serve to continue the work undertaken by the EU Joint Action on Health Workforce Planning and Forecasting and aims to build on its achievements in elaborating further health workforce planning and forecasting.

Follow us: http://healthworkforce.eu
Findings of the Joint Action on European Health Workforce Planning and Forecasting and its Continuation

Eszter Kovacs, PhD, Edmond Girasek, PhD, Miklos Szocska, PhD
Health Services Management Training Centre
Semmelweis University, Hungary

Thank you for your attention! Contact: kovacs.eszter@emk.sote.hu http://healthworkforce.eu